



Proposed Minutes for February 26, 2008
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
37 Washington Street
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
Telephone: 508.228.7231 Fax: 508.325.7572
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Dirk Roggeveen (Chair), Linda Williams (Secretary), John McLaughlin, Valerie Norton, Dawn Hill Holdgate
Associate Commissioners: Diane Coombs, John Wagley **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder, Terry Norton, Ann Medina

~~ MINUTES ~~

February 26, 2008 – OLD BUSINESS
Cyrus Pierce Middle School Cafeteria – 5:00 pm

Called to order 5:00 p.m. Staff in attendance T. Norton

I. CONSENT

1. Morgenstern, Robert – 51804	1 Marble Way	New shed	66-446	Self
2. Norris, Mark – 51805	8 Crestwood Circle	Window revisions	76-80	E. McMorrow
3. Friedman, Robert – 51806	69 Eel Point Road	Extend deck	32-45	Stephen Welch
4. Basile, Stephanie – 51807	8 New Mill Street	Rebuild existing deck	42.3.3-332	Michael Mowry
5. Weiss, Andrea – 51808	11 Long Pond Drive – MAB	Relocate shed	59-34	Val Oliver
6. Drapeau, Norman – 51809	18 Longwood Drive	Windows: material change	71-21	Robert Cranston
7. Branco, Delber – 51810	6B Cynthia Lane	New shed	67-454.2	Self
8. Branco, Delber – 51811	6B Cynthia Lane	New arbor, fence	67-454.2	Self
9. Strazzula, Kathleen – 51812	11 Yompasham Lane	Reroof: material change	55-532	Philip Strazzula
10. Augustine, Patrick – 51813	13 Woodbury Lane	Revise rail, relocate posts	41-549	Botticelli & Pohl
11. 39 EPR LLC (Dorton) – 51814	39 Eel Point Road	Door changes	32-22	Rowland Assoc.
12. Maglione, Bernadette – 51815	26 Appleton Road	New driveway	66-30	E. McMorrow
13. Maglione, Bernadette – 51816	28 Appleton Road	New driveway	66-503	E. McMorrow
14. Schwartz, Gerald - 51817	11 Nonantum Avenue	Move off	87-105	Permits Plus
Sitting	McLaughlin, Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Coombs			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve			
Vote	4-0, McLaughlin Abstain			
			Certificate #	51804 to 51817

II. OLD BUSINESS

1. O'Rourke, Marilyn	7 Old North Wharf	New addition	42.3.1-82	John Lampe
Sitting	McLaughlin, Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Richard Glidden			
Concerns	(5:03) HSAB comments read. No historical documentation included in view pack. Would like to see aerials and Sanborn maps			
Motion	Motion to Hold for additional historical documentation			
Vote	5-0			
			Certificate #	
2. Georgantas, Peter	9 Howard Street	New roofwalk, window chngs	42.3.3	Chris Skehel
Sitting	McLaughlin Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Wagley			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Chris Skehel – move Greek revival door to front of house, lift roofline by ½ floor, windows to 12/12, add roofwalk Peter Georgantas			
Concerns	(5:07) Most windows are Brosco or like kind, West elevation upper three are still original windows and should be kept. Built in 1700 as saltbox and moved in 1880s and door moved to gable. Would like to see that eccentricity maintained. West elevation changes would eliminate original elements. No historic documentation for roofwalk. North elevation windows should not be moved thus causing damage to original fabric. Would need a benchmark			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions			
Vote	5-0			
			Certificate #	

Proposed Minutes for February 26, 2008

3.	Moore, William	26 Broadway – SAB	Move/demo shed	73.1.3-90	Rowland Assoc.
Sitting	McLaughlin, Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Wagley				
Alternates	Coombs				
Representing	Micky Rowland				
Concerns	(5:20)				
Motion	Motion to Approve				
Vote	5-0				
			Certificate #	51818	
4.	Moore, William	26 Broadway – SAB	New garage/studio	73.1.3-90	Rowland Assoc.
Sitting	McLaughlin, Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Coombs				
Alternates	Wagley				
Representing	Micky Rowland – roof lines in keeping with streetscape.				
	Sandy Kendal – there is a building about 15 years old across from ‘Sconset market.				
	Abby Murphy (SAB) – too many roof planes, too large massing comparative to main building.				
Concerns	(5:20) SAB comments read. Due to height of existing and relation as secondary building, the second floor on this is inappropriate. A two-story structure on the corner of the oldest section of ‘Sconset obstructs the streetscape visibility and causes loss of historic green space. Concern for possible of loss of three good-sized trees. Should be smaller and moved back off the street.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions				
Vote	5-0				
			Certificate #		
5.	Hinckley Lane LLC	24/28 Hinckley Lane	Retaining wall, hardscaping	30-21, 101/2	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	McLaughlin, Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Coombs				
Alternates	Wagley				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli				
Concerns	(5:39) Cap should be removed				
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff without bluestone cap				
Vote	5-0				
			Certificate #	51819	
6.	Savel Nominee Trust	47 Pocomo Road	New dwelling	15-19	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	McLaughlin, Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Wagley				
Alternates	Coombs				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli – moving the house west. Will not be visible from water				
Concerns	(5:41) South elevation facing road has no main mass and two symmetrical gables forward. Flushed dormers and ganged windows. Round balcony. South elevation entry porch and two sheds over are unpleasant to look at. Every window 2 nd floor North elevation is ganged. Roofwalk inappropriate.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions				
Vote	5-0				
			Certificate #		
7.	Savel Nominee Trust	47 Pocomo Road	New garage	15-19	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	McLaughlin, Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Wagley				
Alternates	Coombs				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli				
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to Hold for house				
Vote	5-0				
			Certificate #		
8.	Savel Nominee Trust	47 Pocomo Road	New pool	15-19	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	McLaughlin, Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Wagley				
Alternates	Coombs				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli				
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to Hold for house				
Vote	5-0				
			Certificate #		

Proposed Minutes for February 26, 2008

9.	Savel Nominee Trust	47 Pocomo Road	New cabana	15-19	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	McLaughlin, Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Wagley				
Alternates	Coombs				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli				
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to Hold for house				
Vote	5-0				
	Certificate #				
10.	Anderson NT (Westender)	324/326 Madaket Rd – MAB	Demo garage	60.2.4-82	Cottage & Castle
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing					
Concerns	(5:52) Last sat were Roggeveen ,Williams, Norton, Coombs, Wagley.				
Motion	Motion to Hold without comment for a full board and revisions and to come up beginning of March 18 meeting				
Vote	5-0				
	Certificate #				
11.	Anderson NT (Westender)	324/326 Madaket Rd – MAB	Move on-site/addition	60.2.4-82	Cottage & Castle
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing					
Concerns	(5:52) Revised plans to be reviewed by MAB				
Motion	Motion to Hold without comments for a full board and revisions and to come up beginning of March 18 meeting				
Vote	5-0				
	Certificate #				
	McLaughlin departed 5:58 p.m.				
12.	Sturges, Mary	13 Boulevarde	New dwelling	80-126	Self
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing					
Concerns	(5:58) ((Check to ensure that if height changed, the application was updated))				
Motion	Motion to Hold for correctly clouded drawings and dimensions included on plans				
Vote	5-0				
	Certificate #				
13.	Sturges, Mary	13 Boulevarde	New garage	80-126	Self
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing					
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to Hold for house				
Vote	5-0				
	Certificate #				
14.	Dorset R.T.	44 Pine Street	Renovation/revisions	55.4.1-185	David Wiley
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	David Wiley				
Concerns	(6:01)				
Motion	Motion to Approve				
Vote	5-0				
	Certificate # 51820				
15.	Hancock, William	29 Jefferson Ave	Demo	30-125	Rowland
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Micky Rowland				
Concerns	(6:03) last sat were McLaughlin, Williams, Hill Holdgate, Coombs, Wagley				
Motion	Held at applicants request for full board				
Vote					
	Certificate #				

Proposed Minutes for February 26, 2008

16.	Hancock, William	29 Jefferson Ave	New dwelling	30-125	Rowland
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Micky Rowland				
Concerns					
Motion	Held at applicants request for full board				
Vote	Certificate #				
17.	T.O.N. (WW Treatment)	South Shore Road	Revisions: Unit 1	87-137	R. Lamb
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing					
Concerns	(6:05)Last sat were McLaughlin Roggeveen Williams Coombs & Wagley				
Motion	Held at applicants request for full board				
Vote	Certificate #				
18.	T.O.N. (WW Treatment)	South Shore Road	Revisions: Unit 2	87-137	R. Lamb
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing					
Concerns	(6:05)				
Motion	Held at applicants request for full board				
Vote	Certificate #				
19.	Trittman, Donna	65 Wanoma Way	Addition	92-19	Val Oliver
Sitting	Williams, Hill Holdgate, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Val Oliver – ask that in one section not be forced to cut deck back Donna & Steve Trittman – Have few options by which to expand and are asking for exceptions.				
Concerns	(6:07) Deck should look less like a flat-roof element and be cut back 6 inches. Middle dormer North elevation inappropriate; two gables could be bridged by a shed.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions				
Vote	4-0 Certificate #				
20.	Riseborough, Randy	7 West York Lane	Revisions to COA 48931	55-325	Val Oliver
Sitting	Williams, Hill Holdgate, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Val Oliver				
Concerns	(6:23) Clapboard is not a problem.				
Motion	Motion to Approve				
Vote	4-0 Certificate # 51821				
21.	Lynch, Jeff	79 N. Liberty Street	Addition	41-138	Val Oliver
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Val Oliver request be held for revisions				
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to Hold				
Vote	5-0 Certificate #				
22.	NIR (Harbor House)	21 N. Water Street	Renovation (Bldg. 12)	42.4.1-32	Arrowstreet
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Edgerly – dormers previously approved. New design proposal				
Concerns	(6:26)				
Motion	Motion to Hold to go to HSAB and track with demo.				
Vote	5-0 Certificate #				

Proposed Minutes for February 26, 2008

23.	Tekcutnan N.T.	11 Fulling Mill Road	New garage	27-24	T. Eagleburger
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Dave Fenchel				
Concerns	(6:33) "Juliet Balcony" should be grounded.				
Motion	Motion to Approve Alternate Plan B with free-standing balcony grounded with posts				
Vote	5-0			Certificate #	51822
24.	Bousa, Edward	102 Cliff Road	New solar panels (view pack)	41-13	Permits Plus
Sitting	Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Mark Poor				
Concerns	(6:37)				
Motion	Motion to Approve				
Vote	3-0			Certificate #	51823
25.	Evans	11 Wanoma Way	New dwelling	92.4-259	Permits Plus
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Mark Poor – Gable dormer on the front is an item the owner really wants to keep				
Concerns	(6:40)				
Motion	Motion to Approve				
Vote	5-0			Certificate #	51824
26.	Evans	11 Wanoma Way	Demolition	92.4-259	Permits Plus
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Mark Poor				
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to Approve				
Vote	5-0			Certificate #	51825
27.	Irwin, Richard	115 Cliff Road	Relocate/remodel dwelling	41-7	Permits Plus
Sitting	Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Mark Poor				
Concerns	(6:42) Southeast elevation gambrel isn't substantial enough.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions to Southeast elevation				
Vote	3-0			Certificate #	
28.	Irwin, Richard	115 Cliff Road	New garage/apartment	41-7	Permits Plus
Sitting	Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Mark Poor				
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to Hold for main house without comment				
Vote	3-0			Certificate #	
29.	Great Point Properties	1 North Beach Street	Roofwalk, porch changes	42.4.1-89	BPC
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Joe Paul – removed roofwalk & revised rear windows, added a window.				
Concerns	(7:09) Should have kept the trellis.				
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with lattice under deck on West elevation				
Vote	4-0			Certificate #	51826

Proposed Minutes for February 26, 2008

30. Goldstein 6 Sankaty Road – SAB Addition 73.1.4-38 Botticelli & Pohl
 Sitting Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Coombs, Wagley
 Alternates
 Representing Lisa Botticelli – removed bay,
 Concerns (7:14)
 Motion Motion to Approve
 Vote 4-1 Wagley **Certificate # 51827**

31. Goldstein 6 Sankaty Road – SAB Demolition 73.1.4-38 Botticelli & Pohl
 Sitting Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Coombs, Wagley
 Alternates
 Representing Lisa Botticelli
 Concerns
 Motion Motion to Hold to come back **March 4** with new garage.
 Vote 5-0 **Certificate #**

32. Simonov, Iliya 16/18 New Street Addition 55-338 Luke Thornewill
 Sitting Williams, Norton, Hill Holdgate, Coombs, Wagley
 Alternates
 Representing Luke Thornewill
 Iliya Simonov
 David Barham HSAB – style is not in character of original house and such an extensive addition to such an old house.
 Concerns (6:51) Negative space, could be hidden by a “shower” wall.
 Norton always wanted a one-story addition that did not overshadow the original house, which is a small cape; from the street, the addition should fit the simple form facing the street.
 Motion Motion to Approve Through Staff with cedar NTW “gate” in opening on street side
 Vote 3-2 Norton & Wagley **Certificate # 51828**

III.HDC BUSINESS

Review Minutes -	February 19 th , 2008
Approve Minutes -	February 12 th , 2008 adopted by unanimous consent
60 Day Denials -	
Other Business -	MHC Letters – 2 Fairground Road and Madaket Marine
Commission Comments	

Adjourned: 7:21 p.m.

Shaded – Historic Core SOHD – ‘Sconset Old Historic District. MAB – Madaket Advisory